

January 15, 2003

Mr. David M. Berman Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P. 1800 Lincoln Plaza 500 North Akard Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2003-0317

Dear Mr. Berman:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 175042.

The Town of Double Oak (the "town"), which you represent, received a request for all information concerning four named individuals, 911 calls made from a particular residence, and police reports relating to the same residence. You state that the town does not possess information responsive to the request for 911 calls, but "is attempting to obtain those records from the Denton County Sheriff's Office for production to the requestor." You also state that with respect to one of the named individuals, the request for "any/all information" is overly broad, and that the town "is currently attempting to contact the requestor to clarify the request." See Gov't Code § 552.222(b) (governmental body may seek to clarify request if it is unclear what information is being requested or to seek to narrow request if large amount of information has been requested); see also Open Records Decision No. 663 at 5 (1999) (discussing requests for clarification). You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the requestor seeks "any/all" information concerning four named individuals. Pursuant to *United States Department of Justice v. Reporters Committee for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989), where an individual's criminal history information has been compiled or summarized by a governmental entity, the information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right of privacy in a manner that the same individual records in an uncompiled state do not. Thus, when a requestor asks for unspecified information concerning a certain named individual and that individual is a possible suspect, arrestee, or defendant, a law enforcement agency must withhold this information under section 552.101 because that individual's privacy right has been

implicated. See id. In this case, the requestor asks for all information relating to certain people. Thus, we believe that the named individuals' right to privacy has been implicated. Accordingly, to the extent that the town maintains offense reports in which the named individuals may be possible suspects, defendants, or arrestees, we conclude that you must withhold this information under common-law privacy as encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. See id.

We turn now to the submitted information, which you claim is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.005 of the Family Code.² Section 58.005 provides:

- (a) Information obtained for the purpose of diagnosis, examination, evaluation, or treatment or for making a referral for treatment of a child by a public or private agency or institution providing supervision of a child by arrangement of the juvenile court or having custody of the child under order of the juvenile court may be disclosed only to:
 - (1) the professional staff or consultants of the agency or institution;
 - (2) the judge, probation officers, and professional staff or consultants of the juvenile court;
 - (3) an attorney for the child;
 - (4) a governmental agency if the disclosure is required or authorized by law;
 - (5) a person or entity to whom the child is referred for treatment or services if the agency or institution disclosing the information has entered into a written confidentiality agreement with the person or entity regarding the protection of the disclosed information;
 - (6) the Texas Department of Criminal Justice and the Texas Juvenile Probation Commission for the purpose of maintaining statistical records of recidivism and for diagnosis and classification; or
 - (7) with leave of the juvenile court, any other person, agency, or institution having a legitimate interest in the proceeding or in the work of the court.

¹ Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision. This section encompasses the common-law right to privacy.

²Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by other statutes.

You do not explain, nor can we ascertain from our review of the submitted information, how this information constitutes information obtained for the purpose of diagnosis, examination, evaluation, or treatment or for making a referral for treatment of a child by a public or private agency or institution providing supervision of a child by arrangement of the juvenile court or having custody of the child under order of the juvenile court. Accordingly, we cannot conclude that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.005 of the Family Code.

We note, however, that some of the information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. Section 58.007 provides that law enforcement records relating to juvenile conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. Section 58.007 states in pertinent part:

- (c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:
 - (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
 - (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
 - (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Some of the submitted information involves juvenile conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply; therefore, some of the submitted information, which we have marked, is confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. You must withhold this information from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Finally, you argue that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108. Section 552.108 of the Government Code states that information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from required public disclosure "if release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). You inform us that the requested information has "been referred to the District Attorney's Office for prosecution" and that the disclosure of this information "would enable other suspects to evade detection or prosecution." After

reviewing the submitted information and your arguments, we believe that the release of the information that we have marked "would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." *Id.*

However, section 552.108 is inapplicable to basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Company v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.--Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, with the exception of the basic front page offense and arrest information, you may withhold the marked information from disclosure based on section 552.108(a)(1). We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of the remaining information that is not otherwise confidential by law. Gov't Code § 552.007.

In summary, criminal history compiled by a governmental entity is protected by the commonlaw right of privacy under *Reporters Committee*. To the extent that the submitted documents contain this type of information, it must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101. You must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. Finally, the town may withhold from disclosure the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(1), with the exception of basic information, which must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor

should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

VEST

V.G. Schimmel Assistant Attorney General Open Records Division

VGS/sdk

Ref: ID# 175042

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. David J. Moraine Crosbie Moriane 419 South Carroll, 2nd Floor Denton, Texas 76201 (w/o enclosures)